



POST IMPLEMENTATION REVIEW

Northern Ireland
Policing Board

PSNI – Transport Services

Final Report – April 2009

ADVISORY



Notice: About this report

This report has been prepared on the basis set out in our Project Initiation Document of December 2008, and should be read in conjunction with this.

This report is for the benefit of the NIPB only and has been released to the NIPB on the basis that it shall not be copied, referred to or disclosed, in whole or in part, without our prior written consent.

Other than in the limited circumstances as set out in the Project Initiation Document, we have not verified the reliability or accuracy of any information obtained in the course of our work.

This report is not suitable to be relied on by any party wishing to acquire rights against KPMG for any purpose or in any context. Any party that obtains access to this Report or a copy (under Freedom of Information Act 2000 or otherwise) and chooses to rely on this Report (or any part of it) does so at their own risk. To the fullest extent permitted by law, KPMG does not assume any responsibility and will not accept any responsibility in respect of this Report to any party other than the NIPB.

Contents

1	Executive Summary	1
2	Background and Introduction	5
3	Review Methodology	6
4	Best Value Review of Transport Services	7
5	Progress on Performance Improvement Plan	8
6	Summary	10

Glossary	
ACC	Assistant Chief Constable
BVR	Best Value Review
DCUs	District Command Units
ICS	Information and Communication Services
NIPB	Northern Ireland Policing Board
PIP	Performance Improvement Plan
PIR	Post Implementation Review
PSNI	Police Service of Northern Ireland

1 Executive Summary

1.1 Background and Introduction

Within the PSNI, Transport Services is one of the largest items of expenditure after salary payments and pension expenditure. Vehicles underpin the operational effectiveness of the Police Service. It is vital that they are maintained to a high standard and are capable of performing in exacting conditions.

At the time of the Best Value Review the Branch was providing and maintains a wide range of vehicles travelling approximately 20 million miles per year. Key processes included ordering, initial allocation, servicing, repair and disposal of all vehicles. In addition work was carried out to livery, test, develop, armour and provide specifications for many vehicles as well as quality assure outsourced work.

The Best Value Review (BVR) of Transport Services was included in the Policing Plan 2004-2007 under the Police Service of Northern Ireland (PSNI) Best Value Review Programme 2004-2005 that was agreed by the Northern Ireland Policing Board (NIPB) Audit and Best Value Committee.

The Best Value Review set out to consider areas within the Transport Services and to make recommendations in order to secure continuous improvement with regard to a combination of economy, efficiency and effectiveness. Specifically the Best Value Review addressed the following issues within Transport Services:

- Disposal
- Strategic Reserve
- Fuel
- Utilisation
- Staffing
- Outsourcing.

1.2 Review Methodology

1.2.1 Objectives

The objectives of this Post Implementation Review (PIR) are:

- To identify the main drivers for the initial Best Value Review
- To identify and interview the key stakeholders in the review in order to assess progress

- To identify any other pertinent information and documentation which would be useful for this review.

1.2.2 Approach

Following the completion of the Best Value Review a Performance Improvement Plan was developed to allocate responsibility for the implementation of the recommendations. Through the use of the agreed Performance Improvement Plan from the Best Value Review, this PIR will:

- Review the progress to date against each recommendation by interviewing key stakeholders and owners of the recommendations and examining the evidence provided
- Comment on the costs and benefits of the implementation where appropriate.

1.3 Progress on Recommendations

As a result of the work carried out in delivering the Best Value Review of Transport Services, a total of 65 recommendations were made in order to deliver continuous improvement. 59 of these recommendations have been implemented/superseded during previous PIRs and the remaining six recommendations have been considered as part of this PIR. The outstanding recommendations can be grouped into two specific areas: resource management and improvement in processes/policies.

An extensive data collection and analysis process was carried out between December 2008 and February 2009. This included interviews with key stakeholders and a review of various documents. As a result of this it is concluded that all the outstanding recommendations are now implemented.

Category	Recommendation	Implemented	Superseded	Not fully Implemented
Resource Management	5, 6	2	-	-
Improvement in Processes/Policies	24, 43, 44, 46	4	-	-
Total	6	6 (100%)	0	0

1.4 Summary

1.4.1 Summary of benefits achieved

Through the actions which the PSNI has taken as a result of the implementation of the recommendations from the Best Value Review of Transport Services, benefits have been accrued. Specific examples of these benefits include:

- *Resource Management*
 - On an ongoing basis Heads of Business consider the optimal use of the available fleet vehicles with the need to balance private mileage levels. In practice the number of fleet vehicles available has reduced since the Best Value Review of Transport Services hence the impact of implementing this recommendation has not been as significant as was initially intended.
- *Improvements in process/policies*
 - Heads of Business review the level of fuel obtained from retail garages in comparison to the levels of bulk fuel being used. The use of bulk fuel is promoted at a local level with an aim of minimising the levels of fuel obtained from retail garages. The level which is considered appropriate varies by location.
 - Transport Services have structured processes in place for booking in vehicles to ensure that appropriate parts are obtained prior to the arrival of the vehicle. The necessity to pre book vehicles is discussed with Heads of Business on an ongoing basis and Transport Services have recently introduced training for their staff to facilitate this service. This will improve the mechanisms for managing servicing schedules going forward and PSNI should continue to monitor the number of vehicles being pre booked to ensure that the full benefits of the recommendations are achieved on an ongoing basis.

1.4.2 Cost of benefits obtained

The majority of the outstanding recommendations required changing information provision and working methods to achieve cost savings and more efficient working practices. Cost savings should have been achieved in relation to more effective management of low mileage vehicles and private mileage claims, obtaining less fuel from private providers and avoiding the need to return vehicles for servicing when parts were not available at the initial service.

In practice the PSNI fleet has changed substantially since the Best Value Review of Transport Services hence direct cost saving comparisons have not been relevant. In practice it is evident that the process for monitoring the use of low mileage vehicles, the level of private mileage claims and the use of bulk fuel sites has improved, hence efficiencies should be achieved.

1.4.3 Overall impact of Best Value Review

The implementation of the recommendations provided in the Best Value Review of Transport Services have produced a range of benefits in terms of the efficiency, economy, effectiveness and overall value for money provided by Transport Services. The impact of implementing the outstanding recommendations is evident and improved information flow, resource management and processes have been identified during the post implementation review. While direct comparison with historic cost data would not be beneficial due to changes in the PSNI fleet, PSNI should ensure that they continue to monitor the use of low mileage vehicles, private mileage claims and the use of bulk fuel sites. Ongoing monitoring of the pre booking of vehicles should also be monitored on an ongoing basis to ensure that the full benefit of the recommendations is achieved on an ongoing basis.

1.5 Acknowledgement

We would like to thank the staff of the Police Service of Northern Ireland for their assistance in undertaking this review.

2 Background and Introduction

Within the PSNI, Transport Services is one of the largest items of expenditure after salary payments and pension expenditure. Vehicles underpin the operational effectiveness of the Police Service. It is vital that they are maintained to a high standard and are capable of performing in exacting conditions. A large range of vehicle types must be operated because of the diverse functions requiring transport, everything from common and high performance saloon cars, through to 4x4s, personnel carriers, motorcycles, light vans and large goods vehicles.

At the time of the Best Value Review of Transport Services the Branch was providing and maintaining a wide range of vehicles travelling approximately 20 million miles per year. This involved ordering, initial allocation, servicing, repair and disposal of all vehicles. In addition there was work to livery, test, develop, armour and provide specifications for many vehicles as well as quality assure outsourced work.

Transport Services incorporated the following range of services:

- Workshop Direct
- Fleet Control and Environmental Services
- Engineering Services
- Administrations Services.

3 Review Methodology

3.1 Objectives

The objectives of this Post Implementation Review (PIR) are:

- To identify the main drivers for the initial Best Value Review
- To identify and interview the key stakeholders in the review in order to assess progress
- To identify the evidence of implementation
- To identify any other pertinent information and documentation which would be useful for this review.

3.2 Approach

Following the completion of the Best Value Review a Performance Improvement Plan was developed to allocate responsibility for the implementation of the recommendations. Through the use of the agreed Performance Improvement Plan from the Best Value Review, this PIR will:

- Review the progress to date against each recommendation by interviewing key stakeholders and owners of the recommendations and examining and validating the evidence provided
- Comment on the costs and benefits of the implementation where appropriate.

After analysing the information and consulting with stakeholders we will then highlight any clear improvements that have been achieved since the review was carried out and whether any corrective action needs to be taken in order to realise the benefits identified. We will also assess whether the changes that have occurred have been controlled in a systematic manner to assure that Transport Services attains the full benefit of the recommendations.

4 Best Value Review of Transport Services

The Best Value Review of Transport Services was included in the Policing Plan 2004-2007 under the Police Service of Northern Ireland (PSNI) Best Value Review Programme 2004-2005 that was agreed by the Northern Ireland Policing Board (NIPB) and Best Value Committee.

The purpose of the Best Value Review was to consider the key processes in relation to Service Delivery within Transport Services and to make recommendations to secure continuous improvement. Tangible benefits must be achieved from the recommendations and Performance Improvement Plans. These benefits must also achieve value for money for the organisation having regard to a combination of economy, efficiency and effectiveness.

Specifically the Best Value Review addressed the following issues within Transport Services:

- Disposal
- Strategic Reserve
- Fuel
- Utilisation
- Staffing
- Outsourcing.

5 Progress on Performance Improvement Plan

- Recommendation not fully implemented, to be carried forward
- Recommendation superseded by other events
- Recommendation implemented, evidence of improvement found

Recommendation Number	Recommendation Description	Management Response	Progress Evidence	Performance Status
5	Mileage to be paid in cases where a low mileage car is not viable. The Business Manager to consider mileage costs, compare against the 'breakeven point' (10-12k miles) and to be responsible for managing and monitoring the process.	Accepted	<p>Heads of Business maintain data in relation to the use of low mileage vehicles and private mileage claims and consider this issue on an ongoing basis. PSNI Officials informed us that the number of vehicles in the PSNI fleet has substantially reduced since the time of the Best Value Review in 2004/05 and hence there are fewer low mileage vehicles.</p> <p>In the Urban area there are currently approximately 55 low mileage vehicles and private mileage claims for 2008/09 to date have been 7,429 miles.</p>	●●●
6	Business Managers to supply Transport Services with private mileage figures per quarter for return to Regional ACCs/Heads of Department. (The review team recognise that this may require manual checking of claims and suggest that Finance Services identify an electronic method using current IT systems).	Accepted	PSNI Officials informed us that Business Managers undertake a regular review of travel and subsistence, particularly in relation to private mileage costs.	●●●
24	Business Managers to review fuel usage for purchases from retail garages and ensure PSNI internal bulk sites are used when possible without having vehicles travel excessive miles to do so.	Accepted	PSNI Officials informed us that Business Managers undertake a regular review of fuel usage to ensure compliance where this is operationally feasible.	●●●

Recommendation Number	Recommendation Description	Management Response	Progress Evidence	Performance Status
43	Stores Department to be informed when vehicle booked in for service. This will allow staff to have parts available, and if not readily available, to have them ordered and ready for the vehicle when it arrives.	Accepted	The Transport Department maintain an electronic services schedule showing when each vehicle is due to receive its next service. Transport Department then contact the relevant Transport Co-Coordinator or Head of Business in the week prior to the service due date. Stores Department are linked to the electronic service schedule and are therefore aware of the vehicles that they are due to receive for servicing. PSNI Officials informed us that in the vast majority of cases parts are available when the vehicle arrives to be serviced.	●●●
44	Transport Services Staff and Business Managers to enforce the booking-in requirement as detailed in the process map at appendix B. Transport Services to have this included on the agenda for their meetings with Business Managers to discuss any problems with compliance.	Accepted	Service Procedures require vehicles to be booked in five days in advance. PSNI Officials informed us that they discuss this issue with Business Managers on an ongoing basis and that approximately 80% of vehicles are booked in advance. They noted that not all vehicles are pre booked as they also respond to operational need i.e. unexpected repairs and maintenance.	●●●
46	Transport Services to have the Fleet IT Support Unit (in partnership with ICS) to review the level of computer access balanced with the security of system required for Transport Services to organise pre-booking of vehicles.	Accepted	Business Managers can now complete an online booking form for their vehicles. This form is completed electronically and is emailed to Transport Services. Six Transport Services staff recently received training on the operation of the 'Msched Module' to ensure that they are capable of pre-booking vehicles on the Tranman system.	●●●

- Recommendation not fully implemented, to be carried forward
- Recommendation superseded by other events
- Recommendation implemented, evidence of improvement found

6 Summary

6.1 Summary of benefits obtained

Through the actions which the PSNI has taken as a result of the implementation of the recommendations from the Best Value Review of Transport Services, benefits have been accrued. Specific examples of these benefits include:

- *Resource Management*
 - On an ongoing basis Heads of Business consider the optimal use of the available fleet vehicles with the need to balance private mileage levels. In practice the number of fleet vehicles available has reduced since the Best Value Review of Transport Services hence the impact of implementing this recommendation has not been as significant as was initially intended.
- *Improvements in process/policies*
 - Heads of Business review the level of fuel obtained from retail garages in comparison to the levels of bulk fuel being used. The use of bulk fuel is promoted at a local level with an aim of minimising the levels of fuel obtained from retail garages. The level which is considered appropriate varies by location.
 - Transport Services have structured processes in place for booking in vehicles to ensure that appropriate parts are obtained prior to the arrival of the vehicle. The necessity to pre book vehicles is discussed with Heads of Business on an ongoing basis and Transport Services have recently introduced training for their staff to facilitate this service. This will improve the mechanisms for managing servicing schedules going forward and PSNI should continue to monitor the number of vehicles being pre booked to ensure that the full benefits of the recommendations are achieved on an ongoing basis.

6.2 Cost of benefits obtained

The majority of the outstanding recommendations required changing information provision and working methods to achieve cost savings and more efficient working practices. Cost savings should have been achieved in relation to more effective management of low mileage vehicles and private mileage claims, obtaining less fuel from private providers and avoiding the need to return vehicles for servicing when parts were not available at the initial service.

In practice the PSNI fleet has changed substantially since the Best Value Review of Transport Services hence direct cost saving comparisons have not been relevant. In practice it is evident that the process for monitoring the use of low mileage vehicles, the level of private mileage claims and the use of bulk fuel sites has improved, hence efficiencies should be achieved.

6.3 Overall impact of Best Value Review

The implementation of the recommendations provided in the Best Value Review have produced a range of benefits in terms of the efficiency, economy, effectiveness and overall value for money provided by Transport Services. The impact of implementing the outstanding recommendations is evident and improved information flow, resource management and processes have been identified during the post implementation review. While direct comparison with historic cost data would not be beneficial due to changes in the PSNI fleet, PSNI should ensure that they continue to monitor the use of low mileage vehicles, private mileage claims and the use of bulk fuel sites. Ongoing monitoring of the pre booking of vehicles should also be monitored on an ongoing basis to ensure that the full benefit of the recommendations is achieved on an ongoing basis.